

Combating Modern Slavery: The Strategy of Indonesian Government to Protect Migrant Workers

Irfa Puspitasari

Universitas Airlangga

ABSTRACT

Economic migration creates opportunities as well as a humanitarian challenge. People travel across national boundaries looking for work in the country destination. They would benefit from their host as well as sending the high amount of remittance for home. However, those dreams did not apply to all economic migrants when they fall victim to human trafficking. This research would investigate the strategy and challenges of the Indonesian Government and NGOs to promote the protection of Indonesian migrant workers. It is imperative to evaluate state policies, state diplomacy, transnational advocacy network, and the nature of companies as the agent of the service provider. It would show how current practices and law has loopholes that create challenges for a public-private partnership to provide adequate support for Indonesian migrant worker. From three approaches: legal approach, economic approach, and cultural approach, the Government doesn't execute the strategies properly. Even though the legal approach is important but the other two strategies were also essential. An investigation of this research is conducted through interviews, observation, and literature review. The struggle to end modern slavery shall be one priority in protecting civilians abroad if the Government is serious about minimizing economic inequality and change itself into a welfare nation.

Keywords: *Indonesia, migrant worker, modern slavery, NGO, strategy*

INTRODUCTION

If the 1970s was marked by labor migration from a number of areas in Asia toward the oil industry at bays, this pattern changed when the wave of low-wage labor migration seeking dirty, dangerous, and demanding jobs flowed within the region. In the Philippines, Indonesia, and Sri Lanka, most migrant workers are women, the ratio consecutively being 12:1, 2:1, and 8:1 (Chin 2003). These countries

made East Asian countries a destination, such as Hong Kong, Japan, South Korea, Macau, and Taiwan (Urbano 2011).

The position of most female migrant workers is deemed quite vulnerable, noting that employment opportunities are limited to low-class jobs in the domestic are and commercial sex workers or related industries. Due to this isolation, many of them become even vulnerable to abuse, violence, rape, inhumane working conditions, and psychic distress, later resulting in a condition that's similar to slavery (Piper 2003).

Male migrant workers also face rather similar but different kinds of problems. They often find jobs in dangerous areas that give them the risk of death (News Liputan6.com 2016). These migrant workers are also vulnerable to trafficking (Tristiawati 2016). Despite facing those problems, they can remain for many years in their respective host countries (BNP2TKI 2016). Since the 2011 government moratorium, the number of Indonesian migrant workers (IMW) has decreased consecutively until the four following years. The amount of IMW has decreased from 4,201 in 2011 to 4,088 in the following year, 4,022 in 2012; 4,016 in 2013; 3,944 in 2014 and 3,686 in 2015. The number of labor migration to Malaysia and the Middle East decreased.

Meanwhile, the number of migrations toward countries in East Asia, namely Hong Kong, Taiwan-China, Macau, South Korea, and Japan, are increasing. In the period between 2010 and 2015, the top destination for IMW is in Southeast Asia (Malaysia and Singapore), the Middle East (mainly Saudi Arabia, UEA, and Kuwait), and East Asia (Hong Kong, Taiwan, and South Korea) (Bank Indonesia 2016). Indonesia issued a moratorium policy regarding sending migrant workers to host countries with high levels of abuse and violence, such as Saudi Arabia, Kuwait, Syria, Jordan, Qatar, and UEA (Dewanto 2015). The question of protection for migrant labor remains.

This paper addresses various problems the Indonesian migrant workers face who choose East Asia as their host country. Methods conducted include interviews, literature review, policy comparison between actors, as well as finding recommendations. This paper draws on the research question: what are a problem faced by migrant workers, what are the efforts done by the migrant workers to survive in foreign countries, and do they receive enough support from international bodies, states, and NGOs regarding the protection of their human rights in East Asia? This paper uses a critical approach, the concept of slavery, labor flexibility,

migrant workers' job insecurity, and the strategy for protecting the right of the migrant workers to answer the research questions.

ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK

Modern Slavery and Labor Migration

Modern slavery comes in many shapes despite various efforts to curtail it. According to a 2009 report by ILO, there were 9,8 million forced laborers in Asia (Skinner 2009). The new slavery in the global era is often shrouded, challenging to analyze due to the lack of visibility. Its victims are isolated in homes, small factories, mines or remote plantations, and brothels.

The definition of slavery could be summarized but not to be limited as follows: Patterson (in Androff 2011) uses threat and violence as two indicators of slavery; Bale (in Androff 2011) adds the condition of no wage and coercion in the overall concept; or personal domination by a slaveholder or a master with the threat of physical and psychological violence (Patterson, 2012). However, today's modern slavery in the globalization era persists, albeit illegal, its duration shorter due to economic inequality rather than racism, its price relatively lower than in the past. Modern slavery itself is an expression used by non-governmental organizations, intra-governmental organizations, governments, the media, and other actors in the public domain to refer to a wide range of human rights abuses (Nolan & Boersma, 2019). Modern slavery is closer to our life than we think. Modern slavery could be happening anywhere, on the street where we live every day, in our community, and in every element in our life that can have sad stories from they're affected by modern slavery.

Modern slavery is more than a master and a slave but refers to providing new ways to carry out the exploitative practice. According to (Patterson, 2012), slavery has changed in some crucial ways. In traditional slavery, the legal ownership of slaves is asserted, but enslavement is illegal in most societies in the modern era. Human rights are increasingly viewed by international law and international institutions, such as United Nations. However, we can't deny that enslavement becomes closer to our lives, even though the little things around us. Modern slavery not simply be seen as the continuity of exploitative practice but refers to the innovative response to abolition and providing a new way of exploitation (Nolan & Boersma, 2019).

Human trafficking is modern-day slavery. It is the exploitation of a person through force, coercion, or fraud. As we can see, human trafficking is the illegal

exploitation of a person across a border. Human trafficking is a highly profitable crime and exploitation or violation of human rights. There was no space for human rights when people caught up in human trafficking. They will be hurt physically and mentally. Human trafficking includes recruitment, shelter, transportation, transfer, provision, and accepting people accompanied by withdraws, threats, violence, coercion, and physical limitations for exploitative purposes.

Labor migration evokes postcolonial nationalism sentiment and involves issues regarding identity (Schwenken, Rußsattar, and Collyer, n.d.). Migration issues also pose a question on understanding borders. With high mobility, borders are no longer seen as land and outer sea borders but also migration posts at airports that are now seen as the frontier of the air border (Jørgensen et al., n.d.). In managing borders, a humanitarian approach needs to be put forward. This argument is in line with the posthumanist perspective in approaching issues regarding cross-border mobility. Several problems emerge from there. First, the issue regarding legal and illegal migration and a posthumanist approach. Second, the issue regarding humanity, such as death due to migration. Third, the issue of intensification and control competition between states as well as authorities. Fourth, the very minimum space for humanitarian activism (Squire, n.d.).

Labor migration is dependent upon the flow of international capital. States can collaborate with transnational capital to fasten the liberalization of the market. Therefore, State tends to be biased toward the capital. Their behavior leads to minimizing the workers' rights and benefits, including years of service, the opportunity to involve in labor associations, and minimum wage guarantee. At the same time, the liberalization process of the market called for flexibility of standard for worker's rights. Flexibility gives the benefit of leverage for companies, but on the other hand, it means job insecurity for migrant workers. When an economy is growing well, host countries tend to be open and welcoming to migrant workers; but host countries will try to send the migrant workers back home when the economy's unstable. For this purpose, host countries will do every necessary means, including issuing strict regulation for entry, force, and even applying the repressive coercive system to suppress civil activism (Chin 2003).

The relatively low bargaining power of labor might be caused by the offshoring system and the outsourcing or the contract system. In several developing countries that supply a number of contracted laborers, such as India, Papua New Guinea, South Africa, Thailand, Zimbabwe, and Ghana, they lack decent regulation and labor contracts (Bloor and Sampson 2015). This system has now become easier

because of information and technology. For example, in the translating industry, the emergence of the online market promotes greater dominance of freelance translators (Kushner 2013).

For another example, there are ten countries with the biggest ship's crew supply; and consecutively, they are Greece, the Philippines, Russia, Ukraine, China, India, Poland, Indonesia, Turkey, and Myanmar. Crews sent from these countries work for the international ship managers such as Adecco of Switzerland, who supply contracted labors for ships owned by transnational corporations and shareholder consortia. This model is often called the outsource and offshore system. Usually, only the senior workers are contracted as permanent workers. In contrast, the junior workers and crew are only employed for a year or even less, albeit still recorded in the recruitment agency book. There are two levels of contract: one with high payment and one with a shallow one (Bloor and Sampson 2015).

Thailand women who migrate to Japan to work illegally are among many who faces a heinous form of modern slavery. Thailand is the fourth biggest sending country for illegal workers in Japan in the 2000s. These workers arrived in Japan with a tourist visa and incomplete documents. They can only enter a workplace full of risks in factories or areas controlled by the Yakuza or the Japanese mafia (Dinan 2002). Most Thai women who arrived with fake documents would work for the sex industry in places like bars, nightclubs, or streets. These women came with transnational intermediary networks like agents. The third party who acted as the agent reaped a bounty from the human trafficking through fraud, coercion, debt bondage, threat, and violence. These workers didn't have the right to choose their job or workplace as it early conducts. These women were sold, exploited, and coerced to obey.

There are four ways for female modern slavery victims in Japan to be free. First, by being a mistress of a Japanese man who wants to pay for a portion, or even all, of their debts. Second, by obeying and following it nicely, usually, their pimp will release them from their debts in six months to less than a year. Third, by contacting a Thai representative in Japan directly. Fourth, ask for help from clients who are willing to help and find them hiding places from the Yakuza (Dinan 2002). In this slavery for the sex industry, the Japanese Government focuses its actions on operation and deportation. The police tend to punish the illegality of the women's documents if one day they escape from their pimps rather than investigating this sex slavery. Some of these women even volunteer to be deported as long as they are freed from their debts. Those who escape and contact their Thai representative or

the Japanese Government will not be jailed but instead placed in a shelter for foreigners. Once their travel documents are complete, they will be deported and freed from all punishments except for the ban to enter Japan for the next five years. The deportation cost will be charged to the Thai agents. Even though the Thai attaché specializes in collecting the wage of illegal male workers, the work done by the Thai women workers is deemed unusual in that there's no wage collection for the women (Dinan 2002).

Under certain conditions, there is a thin line that separates migrant workers from slavery, or as the world calls it today, modern slavery. In the United Nations Temporary Commissions for slavery in 1924, some forms of slavery include slavery, debt bondage or bonded labor, adoption, and marriage for slavery purposes. There was also the United Nations Slavery Convention, adopted on September 25, 1926. The International Labour Organization (ILO) at the Forced Labor Convention 1932 No. 29 defines slavery as all work or service exacted from any person under the menace of any penalty. The said person has not offered himself voluntarily. In 1956, the United Nations, under the Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery, defines slavery as the practices and institutions of debt bondage, servile forms of marriage, and the exploitation of children and adolescents (Androff 2011).

Other than the Government, a number of Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) manage and fund prevention, protection, and rehabilitation while still cooperating with the police and the Government. Activists in Thailand also seek to raise awareness to the citizens to avoid human trafficking, and WAO Afrique in Togo regarding child protection, Sumapi in the Philippines for teenagers, and the Child Domestic Workers in collaboration with the Institute for Social Work Education in India (Androff 2011). NGOs' activities could be limited in certain countries while they could be tolerated in others (Chin 2003). There are good strategies for abolishing slavery: minimizing exploitation by advocating minimum salary and improving working conditions and working hours. Such strategies are effective when accompanied by a cultural approach. Second, legal procedure, even though it is considered to be less effective. Third, the economic approach includes poverty eradication, modernization of agricultural technology, improving the living standard in the place of origin and other areas (Androff, 2011).

This paper is the result of qualitative research. Both interview and literature study do data collection. The interview is conducted with cooperation from Indonesian who went abroad to Hong Kong, Japan, and Korea to work. Questions during the interview include problem faces by them, how they face

their problem, and finding help from state, non-state and international organizations. By analyzing the human rights condition of migrant workers and job insecurity, responses from international bodies, states, and NGOs, this paper seeks solutions or options for recommendations to improve protection and ensure the rights of these migrant workers. Through interviews with these migrant workers, we have attained problem assessment, migrant workers' strategy, and perception regarding support from the Government, NGO, and international organizations.

By examining the conditions of migrant workers' rights and work insecurity, also responses from international, State, and non-governmental organizations, it is expected to obtain solutions or some recommendations to improve the working conditions of migrant workers. The research was conducted through interviews and surveys on migrant workers, data collection through literature review on the policies and responses of various actors (international agencies, especially the ILO, sending and receiving countries, and NGOs).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

The following is the result of the research. The result of the research part is divided into two parts. The first part describes the actions taken by receiving countries, sending countries, international agencies, activists, or NGOs for migrant workers. The second section describes the responses of migrant workers, as seen from interviews and survey results.

This part will emphasize the result of data collection through a literature review on the policies and responses of various actors (international agencies, especially the ILO, sending and receiving countries, and NGOs). First the international agency policy. There is no adequate data on the role of international agencies in protecting BMI in Hong Kong. Second, Indonesia's policy as a home country (sender) is described as follows. The organization that handles BMI are among others, the Ministry of Manpower and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. The National Agency for the Placement and Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers (BNP2TKI) under the Ministry of Manpower issued guidance booklets for BMIs containing brief information on the phases of registration, recruitment, departure, placement until return. In the pocketbook, it is advisable to be vigilant in encountering coercion, persuasion of a big salary and pleasant job, falsified

documents, the requirement to pay upon registering, violence, and threats in each process (BNP2TKI 2017).

Rely on Legal Approach: is it enough?

In principle, the regulation is ideal, as it includes efforts to ensure the quality of skills for BMIs with dormitories, training, and tests. But it still opens up opportunities for the operation of exploitative BMI agents, which make big profits with relatively expensive dormitory fees. As has been stated by the Consul General of the Republic of Indonesia for Hongkong to Bagus Prihantoro (Detiknews May 3, 2017), dorm fees and so forth officially should be below Rp. 15 million. Still, in practice, BMI pays more. The difficulty is proving the overcharging because chain agents range from PTKIS Indonesia, Hong Kong.

The latest international law to protect migrant worker could be found in several conventions as follows: Article 4 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights; Article 8 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights on the Prohibition of Slavery, Forced labor, and the Slave Trade; Article 7 of the International Convention on Economic and Social Economic Rights on the right to fair and comfortable working conditions, fair remuneration, safe and healthy working conditions (Androff 2011). BNP2TKI provides protection services by accepting complaints, mediating, and advocating. These services have been available online with complaints applications and an early warning system. According to the records, BNP2TKI has received at least 57 complaints of Hong Kong's placement BMI in 2016, a figure that is fifty percent less than the previous year. The biggest problem of BMI in 2016 is caused by the working period that was decided before the contract period is successful, but then they die in the destination country. Thus, the salary is not paid (BNP2TKI 2017). The number of BMIs working in Hong Kong in 2016 is 14 thousand inhabitants (BNP2TKI 2016).

Termination of work before the contract expires becomes a threat of working certainty for BMI. With unilateral work termination from employers, BMI visas only last up to 14 days from termination of employment. Within that period, BMI should immediately find a new employer, after which they can apply for a new visa. If not, then BMI has their status changed to be illegal. In this case, the options are either deportation or applying for asylum. For asylum, they can stay temporarily in Hongkong, but they should not work. Meanwhile, if they are deported, they can go home assisted by the Consulate or NGO, but they can lose the initial capital they pay for training fees and so on.

In early 2012, a Network of Documentation and Legal Information (JDIH BNP2TKI) was established following Presidential Decree No. 33 of 2012. The latest product from the Ministry of Manpower is a social security program for BMI according to the regulation of Ministry of Manpower number 7 of 2017 and migrant workers' family community according to the Regulation of Head of BNP2TKI Number 06 the Year 2017. Director of the placement and protection of the overseas labor of the Ministry of Manpower, Soes Hindharno, stated that during the year 2016, 45 PPTKIS licenses had been revoked. Because 23 PTKIS did not re-register, six agents distributed non-procedural BMI, and two agents were unfit. KJRI Jeddah reported 12 agents because of placement violation. In addition to 45 discontinued agents, 199 agents' permits have been temporarily suspended for permission violation (Liputan 6, January 26, 2017).

Ministry of Foreign Affairs, through the Consulate General of Hong Kong, provides security deposit, contracts local lawyers to defend BMI in court, to regular meetings with Hong Kong Chief Executive, and correspondence for correction of Republic of Indonesia passport data. Of the 35 corrected BMI data, 14 have been granted visa extensions, three are guilty and imprisoned, and another 18 are being reviewed in May 2016 (Tempo June 8, 2016). Assistance is also done to assist overstayed BMIs due to ignorance of Hong Kong regulations which give up to 14 days from contract completion, part-time job seeking for home savings, pregnancy, and childbirth with foreign spouses (KJRI n.d.).

Consulate General of the Republic of Indonesia for Hong Kong, Tri Tharyat, revealed that his office received about two complaints per day until there were 546 cases in 2016, unlike the data obtained from BNP2TKI. Generally, the problem lies in the unilateral dismissal of the employer, passport retention, and criminal case. There are relatively few cases of abuse. The Consulate General also facilitates retained BMI passports, usually due to debt-related matters relating to pay cut by excessive agents or because the agency is afraid that the BMI will move to another country. Sometimes there are BMIs voluntarily entrusting their passport to the employer due to fear of losing it. To overcome the retention of the passport, the Consulate General issued a code of ethics policy for the agency, which took effect from March 1, 2017, and also blacklisted employers that abuse BMI. The Consulate General is trying to establish diplomacy with the Philippines because 95 percent of migrant workers in Hong Kong come from these two countries, with the Philippines as many as 180 thousand and Indonesia 154 thousand people. In addition to migrant workers from other countries, there are 350 thousand migrant workers in Hong

Kong. That number only makes up 20 percent of households. Therefore, the job market in Hong Kong usually increases by 2 thousand every year (Detiknews May 3, 2017).

The Consulate General also conducts six coaching activities for TKI: welcoming, health and safety socialization, improvement of Cantonese language skills, cooking skills, sewing, and exit program. Information on this activity is on the official website of the Consulate General. A welcoming event is held every Tuesday and Friday for two hours, from 15:00 to 17:00. Health and safety socialization has been held regularly since 2012. Cantonese language courses began to be held in 2008. The training is attended by forty participants who already possessed the basic skills of the Cantonese language. The training is conducted for eight weeks, and two and a half hours each week. The training is held in cooperation between the Consulate General and Young Scholar Education and Diaspora Indonesia. Hongkong-style cooking courses such as seafood and cakes have been held since 2006. The Consulate collaborates with Dickson Catering Institute, Caritas Community & Higher Education Service, and Your Kitchen Limited. The implementation time is one month for two classes with 50 participants (KJRI nd). Third, Hong Kong-China policy as a recipient is described as follows. To limiting labor exploitation from the agents, the Hong Kong regulation mentions less than 10 percent of BMI's income, and installment cannot be more than six months, despite other practices. BMI is obliged to reside with the employer. They earn a minimum salary of 4,310 Hong Kong dollars, equivalent to Rp 7 million. Beyond that, BMI also gets money for meals, tickets, insurance, vacation rights, leave, and more (Detiknews May 3, 2017).

Building a Networks with NGOs

NGOs serve as watchdogs for the implementation of BMI protection from various parties, including the Government. The Indonesian Migrant Workers Network (JBMI) stated that the mentoring by the Consulate General of Hong Kong, rather than helping, plunged the problematic BMIs with problems on the completeness of their documents, as seen from seven BMIs imprisoned in May 2016 (Tempo June 8, 2016). JBMI seeks to articulate the interests of TKI, among others, demands more humane working hours, demands security at work, and demands the Government to legalize the transfer of labor to other employers (Suara BMI November 14, 2016). In addition to newspapers, JBMI also articulates its criticism through social media. JBMI criticized implementing JKLN card-making rules that make it difficult and disadvantageous for the BMIs on leave. As written on the

Facebook news post on BMI & TKI HK, although KTKLN is not mandatory for BMIs on leave, the immigration does not understand it in Juanda, which delayed the said BMI flight from May 11 to May 13, 2017. Besides JBMI, at least about 20 BMI NGOs in Hong Kong, including IMA, IMWU, IOM, ICC, Koran Suara, FEA, Islamic Union, Christian Action, and HELP. BNP2TKI asked these NGOs to help rate BMI agents (News One April 22, 2017).

Until this research was done, the researchers could only successfully get 25 responses through interviews. With limited knowledge of the researchers and existing resources, the researchers seek to determine the level of satisfaction of migrant workers through interviews and surveys. Questions for interviews and surveys are essentially the same, divided into elements of problems experienced, then the protection response of the State. More than 50 percent of respondents often experience salary deductions or underpaid salaries from the problems gained from surveys and interviews. Nani Sri Wilujeng replied that the salary she received in Hong Kong was only 2000 dollars even though the contract was originally 3240 Hong Kong dollars. She thinks that many recruitment agencies are doing this kind of thing. Another respondent, Sulistiyarningsih, wrote that her pay cut is very high. Meanwhile, Kasianah only received a salary of 2200 dollars even though the current wage should have been 3400 dollars. In addition to salary, one respondent answered that he/she had experienced health problems and a work accident.

Almost all respondents claimed to have received assistance from the Consulate General to solve their problems and prevent problems from happening to them. However, not all respondents are satisfied with the performance of the Consulate General. Nani, for example, felt the assistance from the Consulate General was lacking. Sulistiyarningsih answered that she did not get any assistance from the Consulate General, destination countries, agents, NGOs, and international organizations. When she experiences problems, Sulis directly communicate them with the employer. For example, after telling the employer, she gets medical expenses when she falls from a ladder, likewise with Kasianah, who did not get any assistance except her employer. When Kasianah is sick, the employer finances her treatment at the hospital. Soon the problem is directly solved with the employer. Although sometimes she has to be employed at her employer's kin house. Another respondent named Rumini also did not get any assistance. She rarely has problems because of the employer who treats her well. The drawback is, they have to work in the restaurant when the contract is listed as a maid.

Respondent named Nur Endah Pujiasih answered that she received sufficient assistance from government agencies, lack of assistance provided by the agency, and sufficient assistance from international organizations and NGOs during the work. Nur Endah said that agents should treat and pay attention to the migrant workers well and willing to help migrant worker's problems. Sulastri also shared similar aspirations. Respondent named Sulastri thinks that the Indonesian Government's protection efforts (safeguards), Hong Kong, NGOs, and international organizations are quite good. According to her, the one lacking is the agent. By the time Sulastri and his friend's brother arrived in Hongkong, they were treated as servants by their agents and told to continue working while their meal was not guaranteed. Fortunately, after meeting with the employer, her employer is good and treats Sulastri as her own family.

Although they rarely get help from the State, NGOs, or international organizations, these respondents agree that the conditions of working in Hong Kong are quite good compared to the stories they heard about working in other countries. Respondent Sulasmiasi even experienced it herself. Sulasmiasi worked in Hong Kong from 1994 to 2000 and in Malaysia in 2003-2004. When Sulasmiasi worked in Hong Kong, she did not get any problems at all, but once she started working in Malaysia, she didn't receive 17 months. After reporting that to the agent, there was also no follow-up. The employer even returned her.

CONCLUSION

Following the search data obtained from 2016 to 2017, various parties have established synergy efforts. First, there has been a coordinated effort between the two countries, for example, the accompaniment of BMI with legal problems. Even Indonesia is also trying to raise the power of diplomacy with the Philippines in dealing with Hong Kong. Second, the collaboration of the Government and the NGOs also strengthening this effort. Even though the Government has done some strategies within the Legal Approach and Economic Approach, the Cultural Approach still doesn't execute perfectly. The effort to combating modern slavery for migrant workers doesn't make any significant contribution. From the three approaches that should be done, the Government doesn't properly implement the comprehensive strategy.

Here are some further research suggestions and policy recommendations for BMI protection in Hong Kong. Several practical issues raise questions about BMI protection. First, how is the issue of office hours of NGOs and institutions? Is it

possible for BMI to contact immediately if the BMI only has spare time on weekends? As well as with the training held by the Consulate General, can they reach out to BMI, whose work tends to belong in hours? How can they get time for additional training? Answers to this question can be searched by doing further research.

Following are some recommendations that can be made by various parties to improve the protection of BMI. First, in terms of the State, diplomacy can be done and maintain the best practice implemented and continue to voice the aspirations of BMI so that they get the appropriate rights in their contract of employment. Second, to protect the BMI from termination before the contract ends due to language problems, cooperation between State and agency and NGOs can be made possible to provide an interpreter facility between employer and migrant worker. It can be done every day virtually, once a day, or as needed for employers to explain the job of BMI. This facility is also to ensure that BMI works following humane working hours. If necessary, this model may be required for employers and workers who cannot speak English.

REFERENCES

- Androff, D. K. (2011). The problem of contemporary slavery: An international human rights challenge for social work. *International Social Work*, 54 (2), 209-222. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0020872810368395>
- Bank Indonesia. (2016). Jumlah Tenaga Kerja Indonesia Menurut Negara Penempatan. *Statistik Ekonomi Keuangan Indonesia*. http://www.bi.go.id/seki/tabel/TABEL5_30.pdf.
- Bloor, Michael, and Helen Sampson. (2015). Regulatory Enforcement of Labour Standards in an Outsourcing Globalized Industry: The Case of the Shipping Industry. *BSA Publications Ltd*, 23 (4), 711-26. doi:10.1177/0950017009344915.
- BNP2TKI. (2016). Pemerintah Fasilitasi Penyerahan BMI Saudi 15 Tahun Tak Pulang. <http://www.BNP2TKI.go.id/read/11100/-Pemerintah-Fasilitasi-Penyserahan-BMI-Saudi-15-Tahun-Tak-Pulang.html>.
- BNP2TKI 2011. Buku saku untuk calon BMI. http://www.BNP2TKI.go.id/uploads/data/data_01-03-2011_104945_Bekerja_ke_Luar_Negeri_Secara_Legal_dan_Aman.pdf diakses 21 September 2017
- BNP2TKI 2017. Status Pengaduan BMI tahun 2016. <http://haloBMI.BNP2TKI.go.id/ccms/#>

- BNP2TKI 2016. Data penempatan dan perlindungan Tenaga Kerja Indonesia tahun 2016. http://www.BNP2TKI.go.id/uploads/data/data_08-02-2017_111324_Data-P2BMI_tahun_2016.pdf diakses 21 september tahun 2017.
- Berita Satu 22 April 2017. Asni Ovier. Selesaikan masalah BMI di Hong Kong, BNP2TKI gandeng NGO. <http://www.beritasatu.com/ekonomi/426673-selesaikan-masalah-BMI-di-hong-kong-BNP2TKI-gandeng-ngo.html>
- Chin, Christine B N. 2003. Visible Bodies, Invisible Work: State Practices toward Migrant Women Domestic Workers in Malaysia. *Asian and Pacific Migration Journal*, 12 (1-2), 49-74. doi:10.1177/011719680301200103.
- Detik news. Bagus Prihantoro Nugroho. 3 Mei 2017. Konjen RI Hongkong kami blacklist majikan BMI yang tidak baik. <https://news.detik.com/wawancara/d-3490157/konjen-ri-hong-kong-kami-blacklist-majikan-BMI-yang-tidak-baik> diakses tanggal 22 september 2017.
- Dinan, K. a. 2002. Migrant Thai Women Subjected to Slavery-Like Abuses in Japan. *Violence Against Women*, 8 (9), 1113-39. doi:10.1177/107780102401101764.
- Jørgensen, Knud Erik, Political Science, Mathias Albert, Lars-erik Cederman, and Alexander Wendt. n.d. General Editors : Titles Include :
- KJRI nd Layanan Tenaga Kerja.
<http://www.kemlu.go.id/hongkong/id/Pages/layanan-tenagakerja.aspx>
- Kushner, Scott. 2013. The Freelance Translation Machine: Algorithmic Culture and the Invisible Industry. *New Media & Society*, 15 (8), 1241-58. doi:10.1177/1461444812469597.
- Liputan 6. Septian Deny. Kemnaker cabut izin 45 perusahaan penyalur TKI di 2016. <http://bisnis.liputan6.com/read/2838148/kemnaker-cabut-izin-45-perusahaan-penyialur-tki-di-2016> diakses 22 september 2017.
- News Liputan6.com. 2016. "BMI Asal Ponorogo Tewas Akibat Ledakan Di Pabrik Korea Selatan -." Accessed March 14.
<http://news.liputan6.com/read/2449089/BMI-asal-ponorogo-tewas-akibat-ledakan-di-pabrik-korea-selatan>.
- Nolan, J. & Boersma, M. 2019. Addressing Modern Slavery. Australia: Newsouth Publishing.
- Patterson, O. (2012). Trafficking, gender and slavery: Past and present. The legal understanding of slavery: From the historical to the contemporary, 322-359.

- Piper, Nicola. 2003. ARTICLE Feminization of Labor Migration as Violence Against Women. *Violence Against Women*, 9 (6), 723–45.
doi:10.1177/1077801203252303.
- Schwenken, Helen, Sabine Ruß-sattar, and Michael Collyer. n.d. *New Border and Citizenship Politics* Edited by.
- Skinner, E Benjamin. 2009. The Fight to End Global Slavery. *World Policy Journal*, 33–41. doi:10.1162/wopj.2009.26.2.33.
- Squire, Vicki. n.d. *Post / Humanitarian Border Politics between Mexico and the US*. doi:10.1057/9781137395894.0001.
- Studies, Diplomatic. 2015. CBDS Commentaries Is Moratorium Problems ? Answer to Migrant Worker, no. 2: 2015–17.
- Suara BMI 14 November 2017. Aturan baru TKW Hongkong berlaku mulai januari 2017 baik kontrak baru atau lama.
<http://www.suarabmi.com/2016/11/aturan-baru-tkw-hong-kong-berlaku-mulai.html> diakses 22 september 2017
- Tempo 8 Juni 2016. Abdi Purnomo. Banyak BMI Kena Kasus di Hong Kong, KJRI Bantah Tak Membela.
<https://m.tempo.co/read/news/2016/06/08/173777739/banyak-BMI-kena-kasus-di-hong-kong-kjri-bantah-tak-membela>
- Tristiawati, Pramita. 2016. “26 BMI Korban Perdagangan Orang Dipulangkan Dari Korea Selatan.” *Liputan6.com*, - News.
<http://news.liputan6.com/read/2439130/26-BMI-korban-perdagangan-orang-dipulangkan-dari-korea-selatan>.
- Urbano, R. 2011. Global Justice and the Plight of Filipino Domestic Migrant Workers. *Journal of Asian and African Studies*, 47 (6), 605–19.
doi:10.1177/0021909611423798.